Essays on Plato's Psychology

Edited by
Ellen Wagner
LEXINGTON BOOKS

Published in the United States of America
by Lexington Books
4720 Boston Way, Lanham, Maryland 20706

12 Hid's Copse Road
Cumnor Hill, Oxford OX2 9JJ, England

Copyright © 2001 by Ellen Wagner

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced,
stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any
means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise,
without the prior permission of the publisher.

British Library Cataloguing in Publication Information Available

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Essays on Plato's psychology / edited by Ellen Wagner.
p. cm.
Includes bibliographical references and index.
1. Plato. 2. Soul. I. Wagner, Ellen, 1949-

B398.S7 E77 2001
128'.1'092—dc21
2001029540

Printed in the United States of America


To the memory of
Pauline Anna Cook Wendler
1903-1991
and for
Paula Anna Wendler
with love
Contents

Acknowledgments ix

Introduction 1

I. The Nature of the Soul

1 Fallacies in the Phaedo Again
   Cass Weller 35

2 The Arguments in the Phaedo Concerning the Thesis That
   the Soul Is a Harmonia
   C. C. W. Taylor 51

3 Supervenience and the Thesis That the Soul Is a Harmonia
   Ellen Wagner 69

II. The Tripartite Soul

4 Plato’s Theory of Human Motivation
   John M. Cooper 91

5 Plato’s Analogy of Soul and State
   Nicholas D. Smith 115

6 Simple Souls
   Christopher Shields 137

7 The Analogy of City and Soul in Plato’s Republic
   Bernard Williams 157
Contents

8 Inside and Outside the Republic
   Jonathan Lear

9 Akrasia and Agency in Plato's Laws and Republic
   Christopher Bobonich

III. Arguments for Immortality of the Soul

10 The Soul and Immortality in Plato's Phaedo
    David Bostock

11 Plato's "Cyclical" Argument Recycled
    David Gallop

12 The Final Proof of the Immortality of the Soul in
    Plato's Phaedo 102a-107a
    Dorothea Frede

13 A Defense of Plato's Argument for the Immortality
    of the Soul at Republic X 608c-611a
    Eric A. Brown

14 The Argument for Immortality in Plato's Phaedrus
    Thomas M. Robinson

15 Immortality and the Nature of the Soul in the Phaedrus
    Richard Bett

Selected Bibliography

Index

Index Locorum

About the Contributors

169

203

241

263

281

297

323

335

363

371

375

383

Acknowledgments

A number of friends and colleagues have helped me in the preparation of
this book. I would like to thank especially Christopher Shields and
Nicholas D. Smith for valuable advice at several points, and Hugh Benson
for suggestions on the project itself. Rosa De Jorio inspired me to
propose the book. I am grateful to the staff at Lexington Books, espe-
cially Serena Leigh, Ginger Strader, and Melissa McNitt; to the Univer-
sity of North Florida for awarding me a research grant; and to Marianne
Roberts for her invaluable computer expertise. Special appreciation is
due Ashley Godeaux for his love and support throughout the editorial
process.

In addition, I thank the following people for their assistance and their
permission to use the materials printed or reprinted in this book:

Cass Weller: "Fallacies in the Phaedo Again" first appeared in Archiv für
Geschichte der Philosophie 77 (1995): 121-34. Reprinted with permis-
sion of Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co. KG and the author.

C. C. W. Taylor: "The Arguments in the Phaedo Concerning the Thesis
That the Soul Is a Harmonia" first appeared in Essays in Ancient Greek
Philosophy, Vol. II, ed. John P. Anton and Anthony Preus (Albany,

Ellen Wagner: "Supervenience and the Thesis That the Soul Is a Harmonia"
Reprinted with permission of the author and thanks to the Southwest
Philosophy Review.